August 5, 2019

Ms. Christina Coughlin  
NY Education Department, SORIS  
89 Washington Avenue, Room 1075 EBA  
Albany, NY 12234  
seregcomments@nysed.gov

Dear Ms. Coughlin and the Honorable Members of the Board of Regents:

COMMENTS IN OPPOSITION TO PROPOSED RULE ID# EDU-27-19-00010-P

We, the undersigned men and women, are mental health professionals: we serve as licensed psychologists, social workers, and mental health counselors and therapists. We are also graduates of yeshiva elementary and high schools who believe that the skills, insights, values, and knowledge imparted to us in those schools have served us well in our subsequent academic and professional careers.

On the basis of our personal and professional experience, we consider the current proposals by the New York State Education Department to restructure and closely regulate yeshiva education ill-advised. These efforts, while perhaps well-intentioned, are in fact based on a defamatory campaign of misinformation against the yeshiva community. Yeshiva education has been extensively caricatured in various media as having little academic, economic, or social value.

In fact, the opposite is true. Different does not necessarily mean inferior.

We implore you to consider our collective experience and the actual attainments of yeshiva graduates. Our schooling provided us with the knowledge and tools to succeed academically in college, graduate school, and (in some cases) doctoral-level training. Accomplishments such as these refute misguided claims that yeshivas provide inadequate academic preparation for professional success. Furthermore, yeshiva education excels in providing many soft skills that have directly contributed to our current professional success. These include, but are not limited to, personal discipline and diligence in study habits, high valuation of the pursuit of knowledge, and a desire to strive for academic excellence. Yeshiva education provides a particularly meaningful background for our chosen field due to its focus upon the complexity, diversity, and subtlety of the human condition.

As practicing mental health professionals who are educated in and compliant with mandated reporting laws and possess extensive familiarity with children and adults in the yeshiva community, we reject the outrageous claim that parents who place their children in yeshiva are neglectful. We decry the poor methodology of studies that have shown yeshiva education to lead to negative outcomes; they do not meet the standards of validity or peer review demanded by our professions and should certainly not be relied upon by policymakers.

Yated Ne'eman
We strongly urge you to abandon this misguided attempt to subordinate yeshivas to the officials and the curricular prescriptions of local public schools, thereby disrupting the educational model that has served to inspire and enable our achievements.

To do so is disrespectful towards and ignorant of our unique communal culture. It is inimical to the interests of the very students you seek to protect and to the goal of achieving a diverse and tolerant society.

Sincerely,

Michael Atkin, Psy.D.
Shlomo Bineth, Ph.D.
Abraham Y. Braunstein, Psy.D.
Ruchama Fund, Ph.D.
Michael Simcha Lax, Psy.D.
Eliyahu D. Melen, Ph.D.
Yosef Posy, Psy.D.
Benzion Sorotzkin, Psy.D.
Benzion Twerski, Ph.D.
Steven E. Zimmerman, Psy.D.
Rivkah Bauman, LCSW
Aviva Birnbaum, LCSW
Esther M. Brodt, LCSW
Jeffrey Davidson, LCSW-C
Nechie Feigenbaum, LCSW
Devora Follman, LCSW
Moshe Fried, LCSW

Aryeh Berlin, Psy.D.
Martha Bockian, Ph.D.
William Brown, Ph.D.
Ayelet Gottesman, Psy.D.
Levi Lipovenko, Psy.D.
Moshe Moeller, Ph.D.
Jonathan Schwartz, Psy.D.
Edwin Susskind, Ph.D.
Ely M. Weinschneider, Psy.D.
Chava Abramovitz, LCSW
Devora M. Beller, LCSW-R
Mindy Blumenfeld, LCSW
Judith Brun, LCSW
Chanie Delman, LCSW
Yeshaya Fishman, LCSW
Deborah Fox, LCSW
Moshe Fried, LCSW

Aviva Biberfeld, Psy.D.
Shmuel Brachfeld, Psy.D.
Shoshana Friedman, Psy.D.
Margo Kahn, Psy.D.
Samuel Mandelman, Ph.D.
Charles Chaim Neuhoff, Ph.D.
Joseph Yossi Shafer, Ph.D.
Ziporah Torbiner, Psy.D.
Suzanne Faye Zakheim, Ph.D., LCSW
Avital Arieff, LCSW, RPT
Sora Braun, LCSW
Linda Chabcott, LCSW
Menachem Dubovick, LCSW
Joshua Fleisher, LCSW
Noam Frankel, LCSW

Yated Ne’eman
Perel Goldberger, LCSW  Tzvi Goldburd, LCSW  Hadassah Goodman, LCSW
Goldy Gorelick, LCSW  Avrohom Green, LCSW  Nathan Greenfeld, LCSW
Binyamin Greenspoon, LCSW  Joshua Hecht, LCSW  Avrohom Herman, LCSW
Tzvi Herman, LCSW  Fruma Herzog, LCSW  Tova Horowicz, LCSW
Leah Iskowitz, LCSW  Mordechai Y. Jacobs, LCSW  Hannah Juravel, LCSW
Chavie Katz, LCSW  Eli Kaufman, LCSW  Basya Kenner-Pessin, LCSW
Libby Klein, LCSW  Joel Yisrael Kleinman, LCSW  David Kohn, LCSW
Lea Koplowitz, LCSW  Chanoch Krohn, LCSW  Moshe Zev Lamm, LCSW
Malky Landau, LCSW  Asher S. Lebowicz, LCSW  Ellen Lebowicz, LCSW
Alexander Leffler, LCSW  Tzippy Levy, LCSW-R  Yecheskel Lunger, LCSW
Yehuda Mandel, LCSW  Berish Mauskopf, LCSW  Rochel T. Mendlowitz, LCSW
Matis Miller, LCSW  Esther R. Nekritz, MEd, LCSW  Mordechai Neuman, LCSW
Moshe Norman, LCSW  Levi Oberlander, LCSW  Rivka Pelberg, LCSW
Marilyn Pilicer, LCSW  Moshe Plotkin, LCSW  Malka Plotsker, LCSW, RPT-S
Alexander Rand, LCSW  Rikki Reich, LCSW  Nechama Reiser, LCSW
Jason Ari Roth, LCSW  Lori Aviva Saltman, LCSW  Ruth Saperstein, LCSW
Rivky Schabes, LCSW  Miriam Schechter, LCSW  Marla Schick, LCSW
Leonard Schwarcz, LCSW  Isaac Schwartz, LCSW  Isaac Sommer, LISW
Aryeh Sorotzkin, LCSW  Jacob Stauber, LCSW  Jeremy Stern, LCSW
Rocheli Sternheim, LCSW  Chaya Shaindy Sternhill, LCSW  Menachem (Michael) Taragin, LCSW-C
Bunim M. Twerski, LCSW  Moshe Y. Twerski, LCSW  Aryeh Wadler, LCSW
Rifka Weber, LCSW  Miriam Weber, LCSW  Deborah Weiss, LCSW

Yated Ne’eman
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Qualifications</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Qualifications</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nathaniel Lachman, LMSW</td>
<td></td>
<td>Daniel Shaya Lebovits,</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>LMSW</td>
<td>LMSW</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tamar Livingstone, LMSW</td>
<td></td>
<td>Dovid Levine, LMSW</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shulem Moskowitz, LMSW</td>
<td></td>
<td>Aharon Y. Neuberger, LSW</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Binyamin Y. Nussbaum, LSW</td>
<td></td>
<td>Nechama Dina Reinitz, LMSW</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asher Y. Reiss, LMSW</td>
<td></td>
<td>Efraim Schachter, LMSW</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Devora Schuck, LMSW</td>
<td></td>
<td>Machtela Singer, LMSW</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yitzchok Tannenbaum, LSW</td>
<td></td>
<td>Fraida Yudkowsky, LMSW,</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>LSW, CCTP</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yaakov C. Aryeh, MSW</td>
<td></td>
<td>Chanie Berkovits, MS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dovid Cynamon, MSW</td>
<td></td>
<td>Eileen Fine, MHC</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aharon Fink, MSW</td>
<td></td>
<td>Chaya Gross, MHC</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Debra Itzkowitz, MSW</td>
<td></td>
<td>Ahuva Leiman, MSW</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leeba Levine, CASAC-T</td>
<td></td>
<td>Eliezer Plumer, MSW</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>David Ringel, MSW</td>
<td></td>
<td>Kayla Stimmel, MS, School</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>David Strauss, MSW</td>
<td></td>
<td>Psychology</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jonah Baumahft, MHC Intern</td>
<td></td>
<td>Berish Weinberger, MSW</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Henya A. Rennert, BS, MSCC</td>
<td></td>
<td>Israel Menczer, SWI</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>student</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Yated Ne'eman</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>