August 5, 2019

Ms. Christina Coughlin NY Education Department, SORIS 89 Washington Avenue, Room 1075 EBA Albany, NY 12234 seregcomments@nysed.gov

Dear Ms. Coughlin and the Honorable Members of the Board of Regents:

## COMMENTS IN OPPOSITION TO PROPOSED RULE ID# EDU-27-19-00010-P

We, the undersigned men and women, are mental health professionals: we serve as licensed psychologists, social workers, and mental health counselors and therapists. We are also graduates of yeshiva elementary and high schools who believe that the skills, insights, values, and knowledge imparted to us in those schools have served us well in our subsequent academic and professional careers.

On the basis of our personal and professional experience, we consider the current proposals by the New York State Education Department to restructure and closely regulate yeshiva education ill-advised. These efforts, while perhaps well-intentioned, are in fact based on a defamatory campaign of misinformation against the yeshiva community. Yeshiva education has been extensively caricatured in various media as having little academic, economic, or social value.

In fact, the opposite is true. Different does not necessarily mean inferior.

We implore you to consider our collective experience and the actual attainments of yeshiva graduates. Our schooling provided us with the knowledge and tools to succeed academically in college, graduate school, and (in some cases) doctoral-level training. Accomplishments such as these refute misguided claims that yeshivas provide inadequate academic preparation for professional success. Furthermore, yeshiva education excels in providing many soft skills that have directly contributed to our current professional success. These include, but are not limited to, personal discipline and diligence in study habits, high valuation of the pursuit of knowledge, and a desire to strive for academic excellence. Yeshiva education provides a particularly meaningful background for our chosen field due to its focus upon the complexity, diversity, and subtlety of the human condition.

As practicing mental health professionals who are educated in and compliant with mandated reporting laws and possess extensive familiarity with children and adults in the yeshiva community, we reject the outrageous claim that parents who place their children in yeshiva are neglectful. We decry the poor methodology of studies that have shown yeshiva education to lead to negative outcomes; they do not meet the standards of validity or peer review demanded by our professions and should certainly not be relied upon by policymakers.

**Yated Ne'eman** 

We strongly urge you to abandon this misguided attempt to subordinate yeshivas to the officials and the curricular prescriptions of local public schools, thereby disrupting the educational model that has served to inspire and enable our achievements.

To do so is disrespectful towards and ignorant of our unique communal culture. It is inimical to the interests of the very students you seek to protect and to the goal of achieving a diverse and tolerant society.

## Sincerely,

Michael Atkin, Psy.D.	Aryeh Berlin, Psy.D.	Aviva Biberfeld, Psy.D.
Shlomo Bineth, Ph.D.	Martha Bockian, Ph.D.	Shmuel Brachfeld, Psy.D.
Abraham Y. Braunstein, Psy.D.	William Brown, Ph.D.	Shoshana Friedman, Psy.D.
Ruchama Fund, Ph.D.	Ayelet Gottesman, Psy.D.	Margo Kahn, Psy.D.
Michael Simcha Lax, Psy.D.	Levi Lipovenko, Psy.D.	Samuel Mandelman, Ph.D.
Eliyahu D. Melen, Ph.D.	Moshe Moeller, Ph.D.	Charles Chaim Neuhoff, Ph.D.
Yosef Posy, Psy.D.	Jonathan Schwartz, Psy.D.	Joseph Yossi Shafer, Ph.D.
Benzion Sorotzkin, Psy.D.	Edwin Susskind, Ph.D.	Ziporah Torbiner, Psy.D.
Benzion Twerski, Ph.D.	Ely M. Weinschneider, Psy.D.	Suzanne Faye Zakheim, Ph.D., LCSW
Steven E. Zimmerman, Psy.D.	Chava Abramovitz, LCSW	Avital Arieff, LCSW, RPT
Rivkah Bauman, LCSW	Devora M. Beller, LCSW-R	Rivky Bertram, LCSW
Aviva Birnbaum, LCSW	Mindy Blumenfeld, LCSW	Sora Braun, LCSW
Esther M. Brodt, LCSW	Judith Brun, LCSW	Linda Chabbott, LCSW
Jeffrey Davidson, LCSW-C	Chanie Delman, LCSW	Menachem Dubovick, LCSW
Nechie Feigenbaum, LCSW	Yeshaya Fishman, LCSW	Joshua Fleisher, LCSW
Devora Follman, LCSW	Deborah Fox, LCSW	Noam Frankel, LCSW
Moshe Fried, LCSW	Donie Moster Dellafish LCSW	Mees eman

Perel Goldberger, LCSW	Tzvi Goldburd, LCSW	Hadassah Goodman, LCSW
Goldy Gorelick, LCSW	Avrohom Green, LCSW	Nathan Greenfeld, LCSW
Binyamin Greenspoon, LCSW	Joshua Hecht, LCSW	Avrohom Herman, LCSW
Tzvi Herman, LCSW	Fruma Herzog, LCSW	Tova Horowicz, LCSW
Leah Iskowitz, LCSW	Mordechai Y. Jacobs, LCSW	Hannah Juravel, LCSW
Chavie Katz, LCSW	Eli Kaufman, LCSW	Basya Kenner-Pessin, LCSW
Libby Klein, LCSW	Joel Yisrael Kleinman, LCSW	David Kohn, LCSW
Lea Koplowitz, LCSW	Chanoch Krohn, LCSW	Moshe Zev Lamm, LCSW
Malky Landau, LCSW	Asher S. Lebowicz, LCSW	Ellen Lebowicz, LCSW
Alexander Leffler, LCSW	Tzippy Levy, LCSW-R	Yecheskel Lunger, LCSW
Yehuda Mandel, LCSW	Berish Mauskopf, LCSW	Rochel T. Mendlowitz, LCSW
Matis Miller, LCSW	Esther R. Nekritz, MEd, LCSW	Mordechai Neuman, LCSW
Moshe Norman, LCSW	Levi Oberlander, LCSW	Rivka Pelberg, LCSW
Marilyn Pilicer, LCSW	Moshe Plotkin, LCSW	Malka Plotsker, LCSW, RPT-S
Alexander Rand, LCSW	Rikki Reich, LCSW	Nechama Reiser, LCSW
Jason Ari Roth, LCSW	Lori Aviva Saltman, LCSW	Ruth Saperstein, LCSW
Rivky Schabes, LCSW	Miriam Schechter, LCSW	Marla Schick, LCSW
Leonard Schwarcz, LCSW	Isaac Schwartz, LCSW	Isaac Sommer, LISW
Aryeh Sorotzkin, LCSW	Jacob Stauber, LCSW	Jeremy Stern, LCSW
Rocheli Sternheim, LCSW	Chaya Shaindy Sternhill, LCSW	Menachem (Michael) Taragin, LCSW-C
Bunim M. Twerski, LCSW	Moshe Y. Twerski, LCSW	Aryeh Wadler, LCSW
Rifka Weber, LCSW	Miriam Weight , LCSW	Deporative in the Cast V

Martin Weiss, LCSW	Aryeh Wiederkehr, LCSW	Eliyohu B. Wolff, LCSW
Judith Wolofsky, LCSW	Joseph Zelcer, LCSW	Judah Zellermaier, LCSW
Golda Zonszajn, LCSW	Mayer Zuckerman, LCSW	Chananya Abraham, LPC
Noson Berman, MFT, LCPC	Chanan Davis, LMFT	Mendel Eichenstein, LMHC
M. David Friedman, LPC	Ellen Gendelman, MS, LPC	Mirel Goldstein, MS, MA, LPC
Annie Goldszmidt, MFT-LP	Jaime Grunfeld, LMHC	Chaim Kantor, MA, Adv Dip Psych
Sarah Merav Keisman, LPC	Jacob Klein, LMHC	Shifi Lieberman, LMFT
Levi Y. Rapoport, LMHC	Shayna Rothschild, LMFT	Hillary R. Safier, LPC
Elchanan Schwarz, LMHC, LPC	Rachel Slochowsky, MFT	Malki Spira, LMHC
Tzadok Judah Stern, LMHC, Ph.D. candidate	Shimon Susskind, LMHC	Abraham J. Weiss, LMFT
Betzalel Wolff, Registered Psychotherapist	Binyomin Wolff, MHC-NCC	Shimon Abrams, LMSW
Tova Aichenbaum, LGPC	Yehoshua Anteby, LMSW	Shimen Asovski, LMSW
Loren Berkovics, LMSW	Raphael C. Berman, LMSW	Menachem Mendel Blau, LMSW
Sonny Cohen, LMSW	Chana Danziger, LSW	Adina Deutsch, LAC
Natana Deutsch Grosberg, LMHC	Benjamin Drory, LMSW	Sara F. Dubovick, LMSW
Elchanan Erlanger, LSW	Shlomo Fixler, LMSW-CTP-C	Yosef Flohr, LMSW
Yitzchok Aryeh Freid, LSW, LMSW	Alexander Chaim Freidman, MHC	Meir Chaim Fried, LMSW
Chana Gerstel, LAC	Shoshana Goldhar, LMSW	Michelle Goldman, LMSW
Avrohom Greenwald, LAMFT	Batsheva Harari-Raful, LMSW	Daniel Hershkovich, LMSW
Hannah Horowitz, LMSW	Devorah Itzkowitz, LMSW	Perl Kahn, LAC
Yecheskel Karfiol, LAMFT	Solomon Kernkraut, LMSW	Yaakov Kibel, LSW
Chesky Kresch, LAC	Leonar Ken e CISW	he keman

Nathaniel Lachman, LMSW	Daniel Shaya Lebovits, LMSW	Dovid Levine, LMSW
Tamar Livingstone, LMSW	Jacob Lunger, LMSW	Rubin Mendlowitz, LMSW
Shulem Moskowitz, LMSW	Nathaniel Nagelblatt, LMSW	Aharon Y. Neuberger, LSW
Binyamin Y. Nussbaum, LSW	Yaakov Rabinowitz, LMSW, CASAC-T	Nechama Dina Reinitz, LMSW
Asher Y. Reiss, LMSW	Mindi Saketkhou, LMSW	Efraim Schachter, LMSW
Devora Schuck, LMSW	Adam Shachar, LMSW, Ph.D. Candidate	Machela Singer, LMSW
Yitzchok Tannenbaum, LSW	Sima Weisz, LMSW	Fraida Yudkowsky, LMSW, LSW, CCTP
Yaakov C. Aryeh, MSW	Meira Beren, MS, School Psychology	Chanie Berkovits, MS
Dovid Cynamon, MSW	Dovid Elefant, MHC	Eileen Fine, MHC
Aharon Fink, MSW	Shulim Goldring, MSEd	Chaya Gross, MHC
Debra Itzkowitz, MSW	Bela Kahan, MSW	Ahuva Leiman, MSW
Leeba Levine, CASAC-T	Chava Melen, MS, School Psychology	Eliezer Plumer, MSW
David Ringel, MSW	Miriam Spitzer, MSW	Kayla Stimmel, MS, School Psychology
David Strauss, MSW	Rivka Volovik, MSW	Berish Weinberger, MSW
Jonah Baumahft, MHC Intern	Shmaria Kirzner, MHC graduate student	Israel Menczer, SWI
Henya A. Rennert, BS, MSCC student	Esther Teitelbaum, MSW student	

## Yated Ne'eman